



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 13, 2005

Mr. James M. Frazier, III
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342

Mr. John C. West
General Counsel
Office of the Inspector General
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 13084
Austin, Texas 78711-2548

OR2005-04165

Dear Mr. Frazier and Mr. West:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 224052.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for: 1) a copy of the autopsy report regarding a named department inmate; 2) a copy of an internal affairs investigation into the death of that inmate; and 3) an explanation of the denial of the inmate's life endangerment claim. The department and the Office of the Inspector General (the "OIG") have submitted separate briefs, as well as separate documents that each seeks to withhold from disclosure. The OIG informs us that it will release some of the requested information but claims that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. The department claims that the information it has submitted is excepted from disclosure under section 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also considered comments submitted by the requestor and the requestor's attorney. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that person may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Initially, we note that the submitted information includes a custodial death report. In 2003, the Office of the Attorney General (the "OAG") revised the format of a custodial death

report. Previously, the report consisted of five sections. In Open Records Decision No. 521 at 5 (1989), we concluded that under article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure in conjunction with a directive issued by the OAG, section one of a custodial death report filed with this office was public information and must be released, but sections two through five of the report, as well as attachments to the report, were confidential. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.18(b) (attorney general shall make report, with exception of any portion of report that attorney general determines is privileged, available to any interested person). A custodial death report now consists of two pages and an attached summary of how the death occurred. The OAG has determined that the two-page report and summary must be released to the public; however, any other documents submitted with the revised report are confidential under article 49.18 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. In this instance, the submitted information includes the revised custodial death report form. The two-page custodial death report must be released under article 49.18 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.101 also incorporates the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. *See* Occ. Code § 151.001 *et seq.* The MPA governs the disclosure of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has determined that in governing access to a specific subset of information, the MPA prevails over the more general provisions of chapter 552 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Medical records must be released upon the patient’s signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. When a patient is deceased medical records may be released only on the signed consent of the deceased’s personal representative. *See id.* §§ 159.005(a)(5). The consent in that instance must specify (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See id.* §§ 159.004, .005. Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for

which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). We have marked the medical records that are subject to the MPA.¹ The OIG may only disclose these records in accordance with the access provisions of the MPA. Absent the applicability of an MPA access provision, the OIG must withhold these records pursuant to the MPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991).

Additionally, section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code applies to “[c]ommunications between a patient and a professional, [and] records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional.” *See also* Health & Safety Code § 611.001 (defining “patient” and “professional”). Sections 611.004 and 611.0045 provide for access to mental health records only by certain individuals. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). We have marked the mental health records that are confidential under section 611.002 and may not be released except in accordance with sections 611.004 and 611.0045 of the Health and Safety Code. Health & Safety Code § 611.002(b); *see id.* §§ 611.004, 611.0045.

The OIG claims that the remaining information it has submitted is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.108. Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

The OIG states that its policy is to “keep a death in custody case open until the final autopsy report is received giving definitive cause of death.” Based on this representation and our review of the information at issue, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to this information. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). We believe such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*, including a detailed description of the offense. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 185; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of the basic front page offense and arrest information, the OIG may withhold

¹The MPA defines “patient” as a person who consults with or is seen by a physician to receive medical care. Occ. Code § 159.001 of the MPA. Thus, section 159.002 protects only the medical records of people who were alive at the time the records were created. Although the named individual is deceased, the marked medical records were created when the named individual was alive.

the remaining information it has submitted under section 552.108(a)(1). We note that the OIG has the discretion to release all or part of the remaining information that is not otherwise confidential by law. Gov't Code § 552.007.

We next address the information and arguments submitted by the department. Section 552.134 relates to inmates of the department. Section 552.134 states that “[e]xcept as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the [department] is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.” Gov't Code § 552.134(a). Although the individual to whom the submitted information pertains is deceased, we agree that section 552.134 is applicable to information that relates to the deceased individual as an inmate of the department. The department must withhold the submitted information under section 552.134.

In summary, the OIG must release the two-page custodial death report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The submitted medical records may only be released in accordance with the MPA. The submitted mental health records may only be released in accordance with section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code. Other than basic information, the OIG may withhold the remaining information it has submitted under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information it has submitted under section 552.134 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll

free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



L. Joseph James
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LJJ/seg

Ref: ID# 224052

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. James S. Gaines
2316 Bert Yancey
El Paso, Texas 79936
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Craig Patton
Attorney at Law
Chase Bank Building
2829 Montana Avenue, Suite 204
El Paso, Texas 79903
(w/o enclosures)